

Maspero Youth Union

*report on the sectarian violence
incidents in Egypt*

2011



report on the sectarian violence incidents in Egypt 2011

INTRODUCTION

We document in this report the most significant sectarian violence incidents that occurred in Egypt during the year 2011, especially after the 25th of January revolution.

We are not documenting the Alexandria church terrorist attack in the first minutes of the year 2011, until this moment there has not been any investigation or legal actions to arrest the responsible for this attack which claimed the life of 21 persons.

REPORT CONTENT

- **PART I**

We document the sectarian violence incidents that targeted religious sites (churches and monasteries).

- **PART II**

We document other sectarian violence incidents that targeted homes or residences or private properties.

- **PART III**

Conclusion.

- **PART IV**

Recommendations.

- **PART V**

End Notes.

METHODOLOGY

For documentation, we used press releases and reports from local and international human rights organizations, along with videos taken onsite from the incidents locations (YouTube URLs sent along):

National Council for Human Rights “NCHR”

Egyptian Organization for Human Rights “EOHR”

Arab Network for Human Rights Information “ANHRI”

Egyptian Initiative for Personal Rights “EIPR”

Human Rights Watch

Amnesty international

We did not comment on any incident, except in case where human rights organizations reports were missing.

- **PART I**

Sectarian violence incidents that targeted religious sites (churches and monasteries).**Summary of the incidents enclosed:**

- The burning and demolition of “the sacred family and Saint Georges” church in “Rafah” in Sinai, on the 29th of January.
- Attack of (Saint Bishoy Monastery in ‘Wadi el natroun – El Beheira Governorate on the 23rd of February.
- The demolition and burning of the Church in a village (Sol) in a town (Atfih), in Helwan governorate on the 4th of March.
- The attack on ‘Mary Mina’ Church, Al Oxor St., Al Basrawy, and the burning of ‘Al Azra’ Church in Al Wehda St., Imbaba, on the 7th of May
- The demolition and burning of the Church in a village (al marinab), in Aswan Governorate on the 30th of September.
- The massacre in Maspiro protest on the 9th of October.

- **The burning and demolition of “the sacred family and Saint Georges” church is “Rafah” in Sinai, on the 29th of January.**

Report of the National Egyptian television

St. George Church bombing in Rafah, the crosses have been removed and the people of the church expelled under guns threats

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZkWPx2zFpmM>

BBC Arabic report – “Rafah” Church bombing

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=U1oZTrgTM7E&feature=related>

BBC Arabic report - “Rafah” Church bombing

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ekH6SLGN1gg&feature=related>

Review below URLs of the burned church videos from youtube:

St. George Church burning in Rafah, breaking the crosses of the church

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=M73SBAFh1_k&feature=player_embedded

“Rafah” Church burning 1

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ObF6mU6GIRQ&feature=related>

“Rafah” Church burning 2

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=z_84LzuXLmE&feature=related

“Rafah” Church burning 3

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=e63MivL8iKc&feature=channel>

The SCAF has denied any attack on the church or Damage in its 16th message on SCAF face book page, and urged the people “not to spread rumours”

<https://www.facebook.com/photo.php?fbid=193509730669284&set=a.191412130879044.43504.191115070908750&type=3>

- **Attack of (Saint Bishoy Monastery in 'Wadi el natroun – El Beheira Governorate on the 23rd of February.**

The monastery built a wall outside its old historical gate; they claimed it was for protection of the monastery and for the security, especially that there is a prison near the monastery where 14 thousands criminals escaped during the revolution days.

On the 23rd of February, the army used unjustified massive force to demolish the wall (live bullets and RPG, and it was the first time ever after the revolution that the army fires live bullets against civilians).

Four workers of the monastery and a monk were injured, for the 4 workers (all transferred to ANGLO AMERICAN HOSPITAL), one of them underwent a splenectomy, and another had his right kidney removed (both gunshot injuries).

Medical report published by (El youm el sabe' newspaper), with the names of the injured.

<http://www.youm7.com/News.asp?NewsID=357428>

“El youm el sabe’ ” Received the medical report of the Victims of the attack on “Anba Bishoy” monastery, this morning, and that left 5 people injured.

According to a report issued by “Sadat” Central hospital and sent to the Directorate of Health in “Menoufia”, that “Michael Saber Yacoub”, 22 years, was shot in the right side of the lower chest with a suspicion of injury internal bleeding in the abdomen, and “Youssef Nadi Aziz”, 26 years, was shot in the right side at the bottom of the chest with a suspected injury internal bleeding and a blood clot in the upper right cavity, and “Joseph Daoud Zaki”, 23 years, infected wound is bleeding right side of the chest, and “Ayyad Saleh Ayyad”, 19 years, suspicion of the pelvic bone shot, Captain Mohammad Hosseini Jaballah, 30 years, broken pelvis to the right side, was transferred to the armed Forces Hospital and the rest of the injured were converted to the “Anglo” hospital in Heliopolis.

Video of the Medical report

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BRyCZDtoCEg&feature=channel>

Note: the witnesses of the accident reported that Captain Mohammad Hosseini Jaballah injury (right side pelvic fracture) resulted from a hit by a military tank (we hope that the SCAF publishes his medical report to find out the cause of injury)

The SCAF has denied any attack on the Monastery in its 13th message on SCAF face book page, and urged the people “not to spread rumors”

<https://www.facebook.com/photo.php?fbid=193404880679769&set=a.191412130879044.43504.191115070908750&type=3>

Review below URLs of the attack videos from youtube:

Complete video of Saint Bishoy Monastery incident

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2vCmxQYeVPO>

RPG rockets after being fired, and Bullets casings

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BUlheXizvOI&feature=related>

Taking out a bullet from the body of an injured

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ExviMV75HCM&feature=related>

One of the injured (Michael)

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vqGFxMIIJns&feature=related>

Bullets and weapons used in the attack

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RwrQTi8KR_Y&feature=related

One of the injured (Ayad)

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IM5RImJR48s&feature=related>

A monk trying to take the bullet out of the body of one of the injured

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=h40xiQOOguA&feature=related>

Rescuing the injured inside the monastery

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BV9rY7CLPzc&feature=related>

Statement of a Coptic priest (Anba Aarmeya) about the army assaults

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8cmCOT0dsUs>

- **The demolition and burning of the Church in a village (Sol) in a town (Atfih), in Helwan governorate on the 4th of March.**

- Sol Village: there has been a rumor about a relationship between a Christian trader in the village and a farmer's daughter. When her cousins knew about the relationship, they insisted to kill her, but her father faced them. When he refused to give her to her cousins, they exchanged fire with him. The clash resulted in the death of the girl's father and cousin. The villagers raged think that what happened is a result of the relationship between the girl and the Christian young man. The situation deteriorated and the Muslim young men attacked the church in the absence of the police and torn it down (The demolition lasted 23 hours).

Although the aggressors who demolished the church appeared in the videos and were identified, none of them has been arrested.

The army then re-built the demolished church on its expenses.

Arabic network for human rights information

<http://www.anhri.net/?p=28691>

Human Rights Watch article

[Egypt: Don't Cover Up Military Killing of Copt Protesters](#)

Official Denials Suggest Investigation Will be Flawed

October 25, 2011

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/25/egypt-don-t-cover-military-killing-copt-protesters>

Atfih, March 4

On March 4, a crowd assaulted and torched the Church of the Two Martyrs in the town of Atfih, 15 miles south of Cairo. Two days later, Field Marshall Mohammed Hussein Tantawi, head of the SCAF, had the church rebuilt at government expense.

Two lawyers working on behalf of the church told Human Rights Watch that on March 7 they provided names of about 100 suspects and video evidence of the arson attack to the district public prosecutor's office in Al Saf. They said the videos showed people who could be identified inciting and carrying out the destruction, they said. They said no one has been prosecuted.

"This is not a case where the public prosecutor has no information," one of the lawyers said. "He just refuses to make a decision."

Amnesty international report:

Broken promises

EGYPT'S MILITARY RULERS Erode HUMAN RIGHTS

=====

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/MDE12/053/2011/en/47be269e-b67a-42f4-835b-787f91044e04/mde120532011en.pdf>

SECTARIAN VIOLENCE

If, during the last three decades, Egypt has witnessed some 15 major attacks on Copts,90 in the last 10 months since the "25 January Revolution", there have been at least six attacks on churches and/or clashes between Muslim and Copts. These include:

□ 4 March – The Shahidayn Church (Mar Mina and Mar Girgis) in Soul Village in Atfih, Helwan, (south of Cairo) was destroyed.

Review below URLs of the attack videos from youtube:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Vk72Fx72_74&feature=related

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ckekcn-XpJ4&feature=related>

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vueXB3QliZs&feature=results_video&playnext=1&list=PLE9A7BBD89B793777

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JR2fGvonGJw&feature=mfu_in_order&list=UL

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-AdAo5TzWN8&feature=mfu_in_order&list=UL

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1aWRWAK21K0&feature=related>

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Wpp4cXK4Bms&feature=player_embedded#!

NOTE: please review the following message sent from the (Arabic network for human rights information) to President of the supreme Council of the Egyptian Armed Forces, after the (Sol) village incident

<http://www.anhri.net/?p=28691>

Translation of the message

Message from the (Arabic network for human rights) to President of the supreme Council of the Egyptian Armed Forces

Mr. Marshal / Mohamed Hussein Tantawi

Leader of the supreme Council of the Armed Forces

Greetings

The undersigned has the honor to bring the following:

1 - we have noted since the victory of revolution of January 25, and the Supreme Council of the armed forces took hold in the country, increased incidents of sectarian violence, from which we monitor, for example, is not limited to:

- The slaughter of gold trader named (Hemaya Sami), in Thabet Street in Assiut,

- the slaughter of the priest (Botros David), pastor of the Church (Prince Tadros), in the village of (Shatb), near Assiut,
- The torching of houses of (al Baha'is) in a village in Sohag,
- The demolition and burning of the Church of (Sol) in (Atfaih),
- The burning of the house of "Ayman Anwar Dmitry" and cut his ear in Qena
- Assault on a Coptic, in the city of (Abu El Matameer), in the province of (el beheira) and the burning of his shop, after accusing him of harassing his neighbor girl. The situation has been contained after holding a reconciliation meeting during which the family of the young man has been sentenced to pay 100 thousand pounds and leave the city.
- A group of thugs terrorized the Coptic citizens in the villages of (Albderman) and (Nazlet Albderman) in the province of (Deir Mawas) governorate of Minya, and the imposed royalties on them and seize their lands.
- Prevent the Copts from the prayer in the church district of (Imbaba).
- The attack on a Christian woman and burning her home in (Sadat City, Menofia)

2 - Evidences point that these criminal acts - or most – are of the planning and management of elements of the remnants of the former regime, and the use of thugs and some belonging to the Salafi groups in their implementation.

3 - We urge you and the Supreme Council of the armed forces by virtue of your responsibility in maintaining the unity of this country and its security and stability to take urgent action to hold accountable the perpetrators of these crimes and most of them known by name, and demand in particular a transparent inquiry of the military ruler in Qena, who personally supervised the empowerment of the perpetrators of the heinous crime to burn a house citizen and cut his ear of impunity and the use of the shameful so-called (conventional reconciliation meetings), that is overtaking them on the application of the law, and urge the victims to waive their grievances, although this does not fall of Public Prosecutions not fall the right of the community in holding the perpetrator accountable and punished, and encourages this behavior, the aggressors to

repeat their aggression because they know that they are immune from punishment.

4 - The Rigor in the application of existing laws in the country without any exceptions is the only guarantee for the rule of law and restore the prestige of the state.

With sincere appreciation and respect,

Signatures Alphabetically

1. *The union of Coptic organizations in Europe*
2. *The Arab program for human rights activists*
3. *The association of Copt friends in France*
4. *The Egyptian association for civil education and human rights*
5. *The Egyptian association for Enlightenment*
6. *The Egyptian association for social and economical rights*
7. *The Egyptian association for promoting community participation*
8. *The MASPIRO movement against Sectarian*
9. *The people alliance socialist party*
10. *The Egyptian social democratic party*
11. *The house of syndicates and workers services*
12. *The Progressive Revolution Youth Association*
13. *The Arab network for human rights information*
14. *The group of legal help for human rights*
15. *The group of (Egyptians against religious discrimination)*
16. *(el ettihad) center for development and human rights*
17. *(el fagr) center Pro-human rights program*
18. *(el kalema) center for human rights*
19. *The Egyptian center for human rights*
20. *The Egyptian center for development and human rights*
21. *The Egyptian center for the right for education*
22. *The Egyptian center for social and economical rights*
23. *The (million) center for human rights*
24. *The (nadeem) center For the rehabilitation of violence victims*
25. *(Habi) center for environmental rights*
26. *(Hisham Mubarak) law center*

27. *The middle east forum for liberties*
28. *The (million) forum for human rights*
29. *The organization of united kingdom Copts*
30. *Arab Organization for Penal Reform*
31. *(kemi) organization for human rights in Austria*
32. *The new generation foundation (freedom and justice program)*
33. *The legal foundation for family and human rights help*
34. *The new woman foundation*
35. *The foundation for legal help for human rights – Aswan*
36. *(el helali) foundation for liberties*
37. *The (sons of earth) foundation for human rights*
38. *(Sahebat Al Galala) foundation*
39. *(Against Discrimination) foundation*
40. *(world without boundaries) Charity foundation*
41. *The Egyptian woman cause foundation*
42. *The independent teachers syndicate*

Cairo, the 7th of April 2011

=====

- **The attack on 'Mary Mina' Church, Al Oxor St., Al Basrawy, and the burning of 'Al Azra' Church in Al Wehda St., Imbaba, on the 7th of May**

The Egyptian Organization for Human Rights (EOHR)

Revolution achievements at Risk

Imbaba incident between the absence of security and law enforcement complications

May 17, 2011

Cairo – Egypt

<http://en.eohr.org/2011/05/17/revolution-achievements-at-risk-2/#more-390>

Revolution achievements at Risk

Imbaba incident between the absence of security and law enforcement complications

May 17th, 2011

<http://en.eohr.org/2011/05/17/revolution-achievements-at-risk/>

EIPR Releases Findings of Field Investigation into Imbaba Events

Saturday 14 May 2011

<http://eipr.org/en/pressrelease/2011/05/14/1166>

Aarabic report: "Street justice... field investigation in the sectarian violence incident in Imbaba May 2011"

http://eipr.org/sites/default/files/reports/pdf/imbaba_sectclashes_may2011_field_investigation_report_ar.pdf

EIPR Update: Sectarian Clashes in Imbaba, Giza

Monday 9 May 2011

<http://eipr.org/en/pressrelease/2011/05/09/1156>

Human Rights Watch article**Egypt: Don't Cover Up Military Killing of Copt Protesters****Official Denials Suggest Investigation Will be Flawed**

October 25, 2011

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/25/egypt-don-t-cover-military-killing-copt-protesters>

Imbaba, May 7

Muslim residents, identified in the press and EIPR's report on the incident as Salafis, attacked the Mar Mina and Virgin Mary Coptic churches in Cairo's Imbaba district on May 7. The mob torched the Virgin Mary church, badly damaging it. The EIPR said that security forces "knew in advance that groups of Salafis had assembled in front of the Mar Mina church in Imbaba, but they failed to anticipate the events – despite evidence suggesting the potential for violence."

EIPR found that police assigned to protect the Virgin Mary church "fled upon the assailants' arrival." EIPR said that according to testimony it had collected, "Police forces on the scene left the responsibility to intervene wholly with the army, which informed the victims that its role was limited to securing the church and its directives did not include engaging with local residents." Several Christian houses and businesses were also vandalized.

What apparently set off the incident was the claim of some Muslim residents of Imbaba that a Christian woman who had converted to Islam was being held against her will in Mar Mina church. The SCAF ordered and paid for repair of the Virgin Mary church. Forty-eight suspects were put on trial before the Emergency State Security Court.

Amnesty international report:**Broken promises****EGYPT'S MILITARY RULERS Erode HUMAN RIGHTS**

=====

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/MDE12/053/2011/en/47be269e-b67a-42f4-835b-787f91044e04/mde120532011en.pdf>

DISCRIMINATION AGAINST RELIGIOUS MINORITIES

□ Clashes erupted in Imbaba, a working-class area in Greater Cairo, on 7 May when a group of alleged Muslim fundamentalists attacked the Mar Mina Church where they alleged that a woman who had converted to Islam was held against her will. The clashes left 15 people, including both Copts and Muslims, dead and many others injured. The businesses and houses of a number of Copts were damaged in the fighting and another church in the Imbaba area, the Virgin Mary Church, was also burnt. Amnesty International was told by residents in Imbaba that the armed forces did not initially interfere to stop the fighting and later fired into the crowds, killing several. After the clashes many residents in Imbaba, especially amongst those injured, were rounded up by the army and the military police. Many of them were later released without charge on 26 May. The remaining 48, including both Muslims and Copts, have been referred to the (Emergency) Supreme State Security Court to stand trial on charges of unauthorized gathering, premeditated murder, attempted murder, jeopardizing public security, inciting sectarian sedition, setting fire to the Virgin Mary Church, and illegally carrying firearms for the purposes of terrorism. A time of writing the trial was still ongoing with a session scheduled for 4 December.⁸⁹

SECTARIAN VIOLENCE

The year 2011 began with a bombing which targeted worshippers at a Coptic Christian church in Alexandria, killing 23 and injuring scores of others during a New Year midnight service. If, during the last three decades, Egypt has witnessed some 15 major attacks on Copts,⁹⁰ in the last 10 months since the “25 January Revolution”, there have been at least six attacks on churches and/or clashes between Muslim and Copts. These include:

□ May – Attacks by alleged groups of Muslim fundamentalists on Mar Mina Church and the burning of the Virgin Mary Church in Imbaba, Greater Cairo. The clashes left at least 15 dead.

Review below URLs of the attack videos from youtube:

Breaking into the church

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ejnU4ErmwMk>

Burning of the church 1

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=h_aAvnDih-U&playnext=1&list=PL1E4C6B050AA89041

Burning of the church 2

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pin9Ogg_KHc&feature=related

Burning of the church 3

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xRJASauT30A&feature=mfu_in_order&list=UL

- **The demolition and burning of the Church in a village (al marinab), in Aswan Governorate on the 30th of September.**

In the months preceding the 30 September attack on the church, Marinab priests had admitted that they erred in going over the permit code by four metres, and promised the Aswan authorities that they would take down the extension.

But the authorities failed to give Copts ample time to be in compliance with its codes and rushed to go for the kill.

El-Sayed admitted that the governorate had given the Copts only 15 days to remove all building code violations.

As expected, Copts failed to meet the unrealistic deadline, a Muslim cleric incited some Muslim village youth to tear down the church with "their own hands".

As the church stood in rubble and Copts were still feeling the pain and humiliation of watching their house of worship desecrated and demolished, the governor told Modern TV in a vindictive tone that "Copts made a mistake and, therefore, they should be punished."

(el Ahram newspaper article)

<http://english.ahram.org.eg/NewsContent/1/64/23839/Egypt/Politics-/Trigger-for-Copts-anger-ElMarinab-Church-as-a-mode.aspx>

Human Rights Watch article

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/25/egypt-don-t-cover-military-killing-copt-protesters>

Background to the Protest: The Burning of Mar Girgis Church in Marinab, Edfu, September 30, 2011

On September 30, a group of Muslim residents in the village of Al Marinab, near the town of Edfu in the south of Egypt, set fire to the Church of St. George (Mar Girgis) as it was undergoing reconstruction, destroying the walls, domes, and columns. Those involved in the attack believed the property was a "rest stop" and that Christians did not have a permit to worship there and objected to the height of a steeple that bore a cross and bell.

However, a cabinet-appointed "Justice Committee," set up in the aftermath of the earlier sectarian violence in the Cairo district of Imbaba in May, confirmed that local church authorities

had a church license for the property, according to the Egyptian Initiative for Personal Rights (EIPR), which said it examined documents showing the Copts had government permission to build the church.

The local church authorities had met with Muslim residents at the instigation of a security official, and had agreed to lower the height of the building and take down the cross and bell, EIPR said. Before the alterations were complete, however, mobs attacked the church.

Mustafa El Sayed, the SCAF-appointed governor of Aswan governorate appeared to justify the Muslim attack on the grounds that the original building was not a church but a service center for local Christians. The cabinet Justice Committee conducted a fact-finding mission to Edfu and submitted its report to the cabinet on October 4, recommending the governor's removal, prosecution of people who destroyed the church, and the reconstruction of the church at state expense. No action has been taken in response.

Amnesty international report:

Broken promises

EGYPT'S MILITARY RULERS Erode HUMAN RIGHTS

=====

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/MDE12/053/2011/en/47be269e-b67a-42f4-835b-787f91044e04/mde120532011en.pdf>

SECTARIAN VIOLENCE

If, during the last three decades, Egypt has witnessed some 15 major attacks on Copts,90 in the last 10 months since the “25 January Revolution”, there have been at least six attacks on churches and/or clashes between Muslim and Copts. These include:

- September – destruction of Mar Girgis Church, in Marinab village in Idfu, in Aswan.

Review below URLs of the attack videos from youtube:

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xt-nG2M0yi0>

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=a0C_p2ztj2Y&feature=player_embedded

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Rn0kYC-sU&feature=player_embedded

- **The massacre in Maspero protest on the 9th of October.**

A peaceful march organized from Shobra district to Maspero triggered by (el Marinab church demolition and burning) incident, was violently oppressed by military police forces, guarding the TV building in Maspero, armoured vehicles ran over protesters and live bullets were shot.

27 were killed and more than 300 injured, the army did not want to reveal his casualties in the beginning, then revealed the death of one soldier (gunshot) before the specially delegated investigation judge.

Report of the national council for human rights on the 9th of October Maspero massacre (arabic)

http://www.nchregypt.org/ar/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=500:2011-11-02-19-51-28&catid=43:2010-03-09-13-00-53&Itemid=55

The Egyptian Initiative for Personal Rights

Maspero: State Incitement of Sectarian Violence and Policy of Extrajudicial Killings

<http://eipr.org/en/pressrelease/2011/10/16/1268>

Three Soldiers to Be Tried for 'Manslaughter' in The Maspero Military Attacks

<http://eipr.org/en/pressrelease/2011/12/26/1337>

Reports from ANHRI

Egypt: Media incitement still present, sovereignty of law still absent

Cairo, 16 October 2011

<http://www.anhri.net/en/?p=4290>

ANHRI files a complaint against the Minister of Information

Cairo, 12 October 2011

<http://www.anhri.net/en/?p=4321>

Egypt: Lawsuit against the Military Council, Prime Minister, and Minister of Information

ANHRI: Instigators of chaos and incitement against Maspero protesters have to be prosecuted

Cairo, 16 October 2011

<http://www.anhri.net/en/?p=4380>

Human Rights Watch article

[Egypt: Investigate Violence Against Coptic Christians](#)

Better Protections for Community Needed

October 10, 2011

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/10/egypt-investigate-violence-against-coptic-christians>

Human Rights Watch article

[Egypt: Don't Cover Up Military Killing of Copt Protesters](#)

Official Denials Suggest Investigation Will be Flawed

October 25, 2011 <http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/25/egypt-don-t-cover-military-killing-copt-protesters>

Amnesty international report:**Broken promises****EGYPT'S MILITARY RULERS Erode HUMAN RIGHTS**

=====

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/MDE12/053/2011/en/47be269e-b67a-42f4-835b-787f91044e04/mde120532011en.pdf>

DEMONSTRATIONS DISPERSED, STRIKES BANNED

9 OCTOBER

On 9 October, a protest organized by Copts against religious discrimination around the state television building, Maspero, Cairo, was violently dispersed by the security forces, including military police, Central Security Forces and groups of “thugs”. Twenty-eight people, including one soldier, are believed to have been killed in the crackdown – although the Egyptian authorities have refused to state officially how many members of the security forces were killed.

Footage of the protests posted on the Internet shows military vehicles driving at high speed towards protesters in crowded areas. Medical staff at Cairo’s Coptic Hospital, where a large number of the dead and injured were taken after the incident, told Amnesty International that injuries seen included bullet wounds and crushed body parts resulting from people being run over by army vehicles. Witnesses described how security forces in armoured vehicles fired into the crowds and killed or injured protesters by running over them.⁶⁰

On 10 October, the Public Prosecutor started preliminary interrogations of those injured in the clashes and 21 people were detained for 15 days, pending further investigation. The SCAF also ordered the establishment of an investigation into the incident, but to date no members of the security forces are known to have been held to account for the deadly violence used on 9 October. At least 30 civilians, as well as blogger Alaa Abd El Fatta, have reportedly been detained by the Military Prosecution in relation to events that day; others are reportedly wanted for questioning.

On 2 November, the Egypt national human rights institution – the National Council for Human Rights – published the results of its investigation into the Maspero events and urged the authorities to set up an independent and impartial committee to investigate the incident. The NCHR’s investigation found that 17 of the deaths around Maspero had been caused by armoured vehicles – a finding consistent with Egyptian and international human rights organizations also investigating the incident. ⁶¹

DISCRIMINATION ON THE RISE

□ Following an assault on a church in Upper Egypt in September, thousands of protesters, mainly Copts, organized a protest on 9 October in Maspero Square to call for an end to discrimination and respect for their right to freedom of religion. The military responded with excessive force, including driving armoured vehicle at speed into the crowds. The incident reportedly left at least 26 Copts, one Muslim and one soldier dead and some 321 injured, from both armed forces and civilians, according to the Ministry of Health and Population. They included youth activist Mina Daniel, who became a symbol of those killed in the crackdown. The SCAF has so far ignored calls for an independent inquiry, and the army is investigating itself. Many of those detained in connection with the clashes were brought before the Military Prosecution. Some were released without charge.

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION THREATENED

□ On 30 October, political and human rights activists Alaa Abd El Fattah and Bahaa Saber appeared before military prosecutors for questioning over their role in protests on 9 October, when demonstrations around the Maspero television building, in Cairo, were violently dispersed by the security forces (see “Demonstrations violently dispersed”). Both rejected the authority of the military judicial system, and refused to answer the military prosecutors’ questions. Both were then charged with inciting violence against the armed forces and assaulting military personnel during the 9 October protests. Bahaa Saber was released on bail. Alaa Abd El Fattah, who faced the additional charge of stealing weapons, was detained for 15 days. He remains detained at time of writing.¹² Amnesty International believes that Alaa Abd El Fattah has been targeted by the SCAF because of his leading role as a blogger and activist critical of the military rulers. No convincing evidence has been presented to substantiate the charges against him.

RAIDS ON BROADCASTERS

□ During the violent suppression of protests organized by Copts around the Maspero state television building on 9 October, the offices of 25TV and Alhurra were raided by the security forces – including military and members of the Central Security Forces (riot police).²⁴

²⁴ See 25TV, “The truth behind 25 TV suspension”, 10 October 2011: http://25online.tv/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=416%3A-25&catid=2%3Anewsticker&Itemid=39&lang=en.

Footage of the moment Alhurra is raided can be found on-line. See <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=h62gdp8FKHo>

THE ROLE OF STATE BROADCASTING

□ Concerns over the role of state media were heightened during the violent crackdown on protesters around the Maspero building on 9 October, when state television presenter Rasha Magdy reported that security forces were under attack from protesters, and called on Egyptians to defend them.²⁹ Her statement was aired while a news roll stated: “Coptic protesters are throwing stones and Molotovs [cocktails] from 6 October Bridge ...” The reporting was widely seen as exacerbating the violence.³⁰ The SCAF dismissed criticism of its handling of the unrest as “existence of destructive elements which are attempting to drive a wedge between the army and the people”.³¹

29 See for example <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E7m08JJdxao>

30 See Amnesty International, “Egyptian army must answer for deadly toll at Coptic protest” (Index:

PRE01/529/2011), 11 October 2011: <http://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/deadly-clashes-coptic-protest-egypt-show-urgent-need-reform-2011-10-11>

31 Egypt State Information Service, “Tantawi: January 25 extension to October generation”, 19 October

2011: <http://www.sis.gov.eg/En/Story.aspx?sid=58525>

CONCLUSION

□ On 9 October, the violent suppression of protests around Maspero, Cairo, left 28 dead and hundreds injured. On 13 October General Adel al-Morsi, Director of the Military Judiciary, announced that an investigation would be conducted by the military and not the Public Prosecution. The General further requested that all evidence be submitted to the Military Prosecution.¹¹² To date, no information about the investigation has been made publicly available and no members of the security forces are known to have been held to account.¹¹³ Instead, the SCAF have cracked down on criticism of their handling of the protest, detaining blogger and activist Alaa Abd El Fattah. At least 30 other civilians are believed to have been detained as part of the military investigation. Amnesty International is concerned that all of them may face unfair trials before military courts.

The Egyptian authorities are required by international law and standards to ensure that investigations into abuses are conducted promptly and impartially.¹¹⁴ In practice the scope, methodology, findings and recommendations of military investigations have remained completely opaque. Amnesty International believes that the military cannot adequately and impartially investigate abuses for which its forces are thought to be largely responsible. At time of writing, no military investigation is known to have fully held the security forces to account for abuses. Furthermore, the Egyptian authorities have provided no information on steps to provide truth, justice and reparation for victims and their families – or on any measures they have adopted to guarantee that such abuses are not repeated.¹¹⁵

Review below URLs of the attack videos from youtube:

clearest video of running over protesters

<https://www.facebook.com/photo.php?v=2197829585566>

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1U007MjPII&feature=related>

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uu32Mu945gs>

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fRU1JW5cH9A&feature=player_embedded

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=em9nC-65Sgg&feature=player_embedded

CNN VIDEO

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LLiagb7-wxQ&feature=share>

RussiaToday video

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Kf4b9HKjPBE&feature=channel>

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-czPBkOfqb0&feature=plcp&context=C3fd3c94UDOEgsToPDskLsr_81w5_2LMLA06lzOFn-

Alarabiya video

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fCAfeRKIUvY>

SCAF international press conference on the incident of Maspero

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gyCe-zZGIpw>

مشهد خطير لم يتم نشره من قبل بداية مظاهرة ماسبيرو – attack on the protest in Shubra tunnel, showing that the protesters were completely unarmed even when fired at.

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TXW1Rjdcmko&feature=related>

beginning of the attack of the army on peaceful protesters

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aXQzObqvg8k&feature=share>

Soldier shooting protesters from an armored vehicle

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UbUInFMZLNq&feature=related>

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EW_d3MbKuZw (Clashes between the Egyptian Army forces and Copts at Maspero, 9 October 2011 part1)

Army soldier confessing killing protesters saying (he received the bullet in his chest)

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q4jzdP0dNvk&feature=player_embedded

Bullet belt about 2 meters obtained by the demonstrators

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Nw2mkVosSH0>

video identifying the bodies of the victims in Coptic hospital

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SshZuBRV9IE&feature=player_embedded

video identifying the bodies of the victims in Coptic hospital

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o4F1H9l-jRs&feature=related&skipcontrinter=1>

bodies of the victims in a building entrance on Cornish

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cJH9ZtHUhAA&feature=related>

doctors trying to rescue the victims

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VtBYMZt2ALQ&feature=player_embedded#!

4 bodies in a garage, after the clashes between the protesters and military police (Video by an Egyptian newspaper, El Badil)

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6YHTLMwCFDA&feature=share>

Soldiers breaking the cars to blame the protesters after

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-cqleVhDTas&feature=share>

Hossam Bahgat is the founder and director of the Egyptian Initiative for Personal Rights - and a leading defender of civil rights in Egypt.

He is calling for an investigation into what happened on Sunday, to prevent further bloodshed

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DI0cn6Kclt0&feature=share>

Bloody Sunday – Thugs, police, army all together (scenes of sectarian clashes against the rest of the protesters; the armed thugs, and some civilians affected by the sectarian incitement made by the national Egyptian television, attacked any Christian they see in the streets around Maspero, under the supervision of the army)

الأحد الدامي - مثيى الشغب والشرطة والجيش أيد واحدة

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=w1kgmK67JiA&feature=share>

Tragic scene of Maspero Martyrs in the Coptic hospital www.facebook.com/chmasbero

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Hv_YZ-l1oAY&feature=related

Testimony of a political activist to France 24 television that the army threw 4 dead bodies in the Nile to cover the crime.

أحداث ماسبيرو كما رواها شاهد عيان

<http://www.france24.com/ar/20111011-voix-du-net-egypt-copts-mina-daniel-maspiro-army-aggression>

testimony of “Hossam Haddad” presenter of 25TV Channel about the raid on 25 TV Channel

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1ygMJx96Cng>

Testimony of “Amed Mostafa” (journalist at elbadil electronic newspaper, documented by videos.

<http://elbadil.net/%D8%A8%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%B5%D9%88%D8%B1-%D9%88%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%81%D9%8A%D8%AF%D9%8A%D9%88-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%B2%D9%85%D9%8A%D9%84-%D8%A3%D8%AD%D9%85%D8%AF-%D9%85%D8%B5%D8%B7%D9%81%D9%89-%D9%8A%D9%83%D8%AA/>

Coverage of the national Egyptian television of the Maspero incidents, sectarian incitement, claiming that the Coptic protesters opened fire on the military forces in front of the TV building and killed 3 soldiers and injured 20 others, without mentioning any news about the dead or injured victims from the protesters

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E7m08JJdxao&feature=related>

- **PART II**

Sectarian violence incidents that targeted homes or residences or private properties.

- **Muqattam, March 8,**
- **Qena, March 20,**
- **Abu Qurqas, April 19**
- **Assuit, 29th – 30th December**

- **Mugattam, March 8,**

Human Rights Watch article

Egypt: Don't Cover Up Military Killing of Copt Protesters

Official Denials Suggest Investigation Will be Flawed

October 25, 2011

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/25/egypt-don-t-cover-military-killing-copt-protesters>

Muqattam, March 8

On March 8, Coptic Christians in the east Cairo suburb of Muqattam held a march to protest the church arson in Atfih. They blocked a main road that runs by their neighborhood for two hours. A crowd attacked the demonstrators, and fighting and shooting broke out. Thirteen people died, according to the state-run Al-Ahram newspaper and the health ministry. Those attacking the demonstrators set fire to several Christian homes and businesses.

Christian residents trapped 11 Muslim men trying to set fire to a business and turned the men over to a military officer on the scene. On March 15, church lawyers said they gave the list of the 11 Muslims to the Cairo public prosecutor's office and filed a formal complaint. None of them had been called in for questioning as of May, the lawyers said.

Amnesty international report:

Broken promises

EGYPT'S MILITARY RULERS Erode HUMAN RIGHTS

=====

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/MDE12/053/2011/en/47be269e-b67a-42f4-835b-787f91044e04/mde120532011en.pdf>

SECTARIAN VIOLENCE

If, during the last three decades, Egypt has witnessed some 15 major attacks on Copts,90 in the last 10 months since the “25 January Revolution”, there have been at least six attacks on churches and/or clashes between Muslim and Copts. These include:

8 March – violent clashes between Muslims and Copts in the Manshiyet Nasser neighbourhood, at the Al-Muqattam Hill, east Cairo, home to a large Coptic community of garbage collectors (*zabbaleen*). The clashes left 10 dead and others injured.

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oJ_XVaOGMYE&feature=channel

http://www.youtube.com/watch?annotation_id=annotation_541930&feature=iv&src_vid=oJ_XVaOGMYE&v=YW52edbfh9Q

- **Qena, March 20**

Arabic network for human rights information

<http://www.anhri.net/?p=28691>

- The burning of the house of "Ayman Anwar Dmitry" and cut his ear in Qena

Human Rights Watch article

Egypt: Don't Cover Up Military Killing of Copt Protesters

Official Denials Suggest Investigation Will be Flawed

October 25, 2011

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/25/egypt-don-t-cover-military-killing-copt-protesters>

Qena, March 20

On March 20, unknown arsonists set fire to a flat owned by Ayman Anwar Mitry, a schoolteacher, who had rented it to three women. After firefighters extinguished the blaze, Mitry spent the day there on guard, he told Human Rights Watch. Three men he identified as Salafis visited him, he said, and accused him of renting the flat to prostitutes. Later 20 men entered the apartment, beat him, and cut off his ear.

Mitry provided his account of the incident to police the next day. He told Human Rights Watch that the alleged assailants then began to threaten his relatives to get him to change his story. The public prosecutor told Mitry that the alleged assailants would be called for questioning but, Mitry and a lawyer said, they were not.

In the absence of any steps by the authorities to arrest the perpetrators, and fearing reprisal, Mitry attended a reconciliation meeting with representatives of the dozen men who assaulted him, along with Coptic priests.

"The reconciliation was basically that I drop charges but get no compensation in return," Mitry said. He agreed out of fear, he added.

On March 27, Mitry traveled to Cairo to meet with the Ahmed al-Tayeb, Grand Imam of Al Azhar, the chief Islamic institution in Egypt, who promised to pay for surgery to repair his ear. Mitry told Human Rights Watch he decided to return to Qena and finance his own operation because “he didn’t think the hospital was a good one.”

- **Abu Qurqas, April 19**

Human Rights Watch article

Egypt: Don't Cover Up Military Killing of Copt Protesters

Official Denials Suggest Investigation Will be Flawed

October 25, 2011

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/25/egypt-don-t-cover-military-killing-copt-protesters>

Abu Qurqas, April 19

On April 19, in Abu Qurqas, 120 miles south of Cairo, a dispute between a Muslim minibus driver and security guards at the house of a prominent Coptic politician escalated into an assault by dozens of Muslims on the house and Coptic-owned businesses. Rioting broke out and dozens of Christian homes and businesses were burned. According to Al-Ahram, two people died in the unrest.

The circumstances are in dispute. A lawyer for a Christian defendant said those killed were Muslim and were victims of an intra-Muslim shootout that was then blamed on the Christian security guards.

Ten Muslims and eight Copts, including a Christian politician, Alaa Reda Roushdi, the owner of the house, are being tried in the episode in the Emergency State Security Court.

- **Assuit, 29th – 30th December**

أحداث أسبوط الطائفية... حين يغيب القانون وحين تعالج "مصر الثورة" أزماتها على خطى "أمن الدولة": التهجير القسري
تكريس للطائفية

<http://eipr.org/pressrelease/2012/01/05/1339>

- **PART III**

Conclusion

- The incident of building a wall outside the historical gate of the St. Bishoy Monastery, which is considered as building on land owned by the state, was faced by extreme unprecedented violence from the army, no similar incident has been handled this way before, and it is considered the first time that the army fires live ammunition on civilians after the revolution.
- Since the beginning of 2011, there has been six incidents of assaults on churches, the patterns of such incidents varied from intrusion, vandalism, burning, and demolition, along with a number of incidents of sectarian violence against individuals or property or houses of the Copts.

Some of these incidents underwent a Pattern of Impunity for Sectarian Violence such as:

The burning and demolition of “the sacred family and Saint Georges” church in “Rafah” in Sinai, on the 29th of January

Atfih, March 4

Muqattam, March 8

Qena, March 20

The Burning of Mar Girgis Church in Marinab, Edfu, September 30

Attacks Prosecuted in State Security Courts

Imbaba, May 7

Abu Qurqas, April 19

- On May 8, following a bloody incident in Cairo's Imbaba neighborhood that left 12 dead, Justice Minister Abdel Aziz al-Guindi pledged to use an "iron hand" against "all those who seek to tamper with the nation's security." He said the government would act "immediately and firmly to implement laws that criminalize attacks against places of worship and freedom of belief."

On May 11, the cabinet announced a set of measures to address Egypt's sectarian problem. This included a promise to investigate church attacks in Sol and Atfih, to introduce a law criminalizing discrimination, to change the law discriminating against Christians in the construction of churches, and to establish a special committee to address sectarian violence.

Despite his promises, prosecutors failed to investigate the destruction of the church in Marinab on September 30, which sparked the October 9 protest in Cairo.

- **The Maspero Massacre has been handled legally as follows:**

First:

Been under the case (No. 5441/2011 cover of eastern military court) as a misdemeanour under Article 238 (paragraph 3) of the Penal Code which punishes the manslaughter (unintentional, accidental killing), a crime punishable by imprisonment not exceeding for a period of seven years.

the list of defendants is limited on each of the: soldier / Mahmoud Sayed Abdel-Hamid Sulaiman (21 years - the power of K-1 military police), and a soldier / Karam Hamid Mohammed Hamid (21 years - the power of K-1 military police), and a soldier / Mahmoud Jamal Taha Mahmoud (22 years of the power of Q 5 military police) and all affiliated to the central Military Zone.

The military court charged the three soldiers of "Causing, by their mistake the death of fourteen people from the crowd in front of the Radio and Television Union building".

This resulted from their lack of precaution and negligence, being the drivers of the military and armoured vehicles belonging to the armed forces, and this by driving them in a chaotic way that is not proportional to the state of the road which was fully crowded, which lead to hitting the victims.

Despite what is stated in the report of the Fact-Finding Committee of the National Council for Human Rights:

Violation of the right to life and crimes of murder crushed

*It was proven that the military troops stationed at the site of the events used armoured vehicles to disperse the demonstrators, and this by the armoured vehicles passing through Corniche El Nile street Back and forth at a great speed amid the demonstrators, killing at least 12 citizens under their tires, which constitute serious violations of the right to life, and flagrant breach of due commitments by the officials Responsible for law enforcement and protecting the demonstrators, **ranking it to first degree murder.***

Second

For the rest of the martyrs (other than the 14 who died crushed), and the army Soldier shot.

The president of the Cairo Appeal Court has dispatched two judges to complete the prosecution investigations into clashes between the army and demonstrators in October, that took place in front of the state television building at Maspero in central Cairo.

Ten more suspects were added to the case, bringing the total of jailed suspects pending investigation to 28, three of whom are journalists.

The investigative judge conducted investigations with the Defendants (More than 30 civilians including prominent activist Alaa Abdel-Fattah) in the charges against them: Inciting sectarian strife, murder and attempted murder, carrying a firearm without a license, disturbing public security, attacking security men

The case was investigated by the military prosecution and then recently referred to State Security Prosecution before it was sent to an investigations judge.

On Thursday the 15th of December 2011, a Cairo court released 27 detainees involved in the Maspero violence case, while Alaa Abdel-Fattah was released on residence on the 25th of December.

- **PART IV**

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Amend or abolish all laws that discriminate on the basis of race; colour; religion; ethnicity; birth; sex; political or other opinion; national or social origin; property; or other status.
- Change all laws and practices that discriminate against religious or ethnic minorities to ensure that they uphold Article 18 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, which guarantees freedom of thought, conscience and religion. Such laws include Article 98(f) of the Penal Code, which criminalizes the exploitation of religion to “disturb national peace”; and Presidential Decree 291/2005, which makes repair or expansion of Christian churches subject to a permit from the regional governor.
- Investigate all incidents of sectarian violence and determine the culprit and the instigators and perpetrators and bring them to a fair trial
- Recommendations we adopt from “Human rights watch”
The military cannot investigate itself with any credibility. This had been an essentially peaceful protest until the military used excessive force and military vehicles ran over protesters. The only hope for justice for the victims is an independent civilian-led investigation that the army fully cooperates with and cannot control and that leads to the prosecution of those responsible.

International Law on Military Investigations of Human Rights Abuses

In the draft principles on military justice adopted by the United Nations Human Rights Commission, principle no. 9 states: “In all circumstances, the jurisdiction of military courts should be set aside in favor of the jurisdiction of the ordinary courts to conduct inquiries into serious human rights violations such as extrajudicial executions, enforced disappearances and torture, and to prosecute and try persons accused of such crimes.”

The European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) has taken the position that trials before military courts raise concerns of fairness. In *Findlay v. United Kingdom*, the court found that a military court’s ruling was neither independent nor impartial because members of the court who issued the decision were subordinates of the prosecuting officer, who had the authority to change any decision that the court made. In *Al Skeini and others v. United Kingdom* the Court said: For an investigation into alleged unlawful killing by State agents to be effective, it is necessary for the persons responsible for and carrying out the investigation to be independent from those implicated in the events. This means not only a lack of hierarchical or institutional connection but also a practical independence.

- **PART V**

ENDNOTES

- **Sectarian violence incident in early 2012**

- **Al-Amiriya, 27th of January 2012**

Crimes in Al-Amiriya: Collective Punishment of Copts and Official Sanction for Sectarian Attacks

<http://eipr.org/en/pressrelease/2012/02/12/1367>

(Arabic reports)

لتقصي الحقائق وليست للحل العرفي: على لجنة العامرية اقتراح حلول بدلا من إنكار التهجير القسري بعد الأحداث الطائفية

<http://eipr.org/pressrelease/2012/02/21/1374>

المركز المصري لحقوق السكن طرد 9 أسر مسيحية من قرية شربات على الطريقة الإسرائيلية

<http://www.anhri.net/?p=48801>

Videos of testimonies on the incident

http://www.youtube.com/watch?feature=player_embedded&v=SbKGAAbGgcpQ

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4LMsVZyfmKk>

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DXpkbmA053U&feature=youtu.be>

- **For incidents prior to 2011, please refer to EIPR reports:**

Naga Hammadi: Witnesses to the Strife

<http://eipr.org/en/report/2010/01/21/1070>

http://eipr.org/sites/default/files/reports/pdf/nagahammadi_witnesses_to_the_strife_report2010.pdf

Two Years of Sectarian Violence: What happened? Where do we begin? An Analytical Study of Jan 2008 -Jan 2010

<http://eipr.org/en/report/2010/04/11/776>

http://eipr.org/sites/default/files/reports/pdf/Sectarian_Violence_inTwoYears_EN.pdf